

American Journal of Economic and Management Business

p-ISSN: XXXX-XXXX e-ISSN: 2835-5199 Vol. 3 No. 12 December 2024

Development of Halal Tourism: Analysis of Determining Factors and its Impact on the Global Economy

Gebie Yoga Efrizal Rizkitama^{1*}, Nurwahidin², Mulawarman Hannase³, Mohammad Izdiyan Muttaqin⁴, Veithzal Rivai Zainal⁵

1,2,3,4,5 Universitas Indonesia, Jakarta, Indonesia Emails: gebie.yoga@ui.ac.id, nurwahidin@ui.ac.id, mulawarmanhannase@ui.ac.id, moh.izdiyan@ui.ac.id, veithzal47@gmail.com

Abstract

Halal tourism has emerged as a significant contributor to global economic growth, addressing the unique needs of Muslim travelers while fostering sustainable development. This study aims to explore the key determinants influencing Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty, as well as the economic impacts of halal tourism. Utilizing a systematic literature review approach guided by PRISMA 2020, 17 relevant studies published between 2019 and 2024 were analyzed. The review included studies from diverse geographical contexts, focusing on determinants such as CHSE (Cleanliness, Health, Safety, and Environment), service quality, accessibility, and faith-based marketing. The results indicate that these determinants play a pivotal role in shaping Muslim tourists' experiences, with CHSE implementation and culturally aligned services enhancing satisfaction and revisit intentions. Furthermore, halal tourism contributes significantly to economic outcomes, including GDP growth, job creation, and market diversification, particularly in countries like Indonesia and Malaysia. However, regional disparities in research highlight the need for broader representation and exploration of underrepresented areas. This study underscores the importance of strategic collaboration among policymakers, destination managers, and service providers to optimize the potential of halal tourism. By addressing research gaps, such as the integration of digital technologies and sustainability practices, future research can further enhance the inclusivity and global impact of this sector. Ultimately, this study provides a comprehensive framework for advancing halal tourism as a sustainable and economically viable industry.

Keywords: Halal Tourism, Muslim Tourist Satisfaction, Economic Impact, CHSE Implementation

INTRODUCTION

Halal tourism has emerged as one of the fastest-growing segments in the global tourism industry, fueled by the increasing Muslim population and their awareness of halal travel needs. According to the Global Muslim Travel Index (GMTI), the number of Muslim travellers is projected to reach 230 million by 2026, contributing a significant USD 300 billion to the global economy. This growth is primarily driven by young, educated Muslims with rising disposable incomes who are increasingly motivated to explore international travel destinations (Mohajer et al., 2022). In response, both Muslim-majority and non-Muslim countries have begun to expand

their infrastructure and services to accommodate this growing market, ensuring that their offerings align with Islamic principles.

Several economic and logistical factors significantly influence the preferences of Muslim travelers. Variables such as gross domestic product (GDP), population size, and exchange rates play a pivotal role in shaping the demand for halal tourism (Tangvitoontham & Sattayanuwat, 2022). Furthermore, ease of travel, including visa-free policies, direct flights, and language similarities, enhances the attractiveness of certain destinations. Essential attributes, such as family-friendly environments, halal-certified food, and Muslim-friendly accommodations, are particularly influential in attracting this demographic (Yuliviona et al., 2019).

Market trends reveal that the expenditure of Muslim travellers continues to increase, accounting for over 13% of global tourism spending as of 2020 (Rashid et al., 2020). In this evolving market, new destinations are adopting strategies to position themselves as Muslimfriendly, offering services and facilities that cater to the unique requirements of this growing segment (Adie, 2019). Countries such as Indonesia and Malaysia, for instance, have heavily invested in promoting halal tourism to strengthen their position as leading destinations in this sector (Peristiwo, 2020a).

However, developing halal tourism comes with its own set of challenges. One of the primary obstacles is the lack of standardized global certification for halal services, which creates uncertainties for Muslim travellers navigating international destinations. In addition, many locations still struggle to provide adequate infrastructure, such as halal-certified restaurants and prayer facilities, which are essential for Muslim travellers. Sustainability also presents a challenge, as the rapid growth of halal tourism must balance economic gains with environmental and social considerations. Integrating Islamic values with sustainable tourism practices has been identified as a crucial step to ensure long-term benefits for all stakeholders (Setiawan et al., 2024).

In conclusion, halal tourism represents a promising opportunity to drive global economic growth while fostering inclusivity and sustainability. The success of this sector depends on the ability of destinations to understand and meet the unique needs of Muslim travellers while maintaining high service standards. Collaborative efforts between governments, industry players, and local communities will be essential to build a robust and sustainable halal tourism ecosystem that benefits both tourists and host countries alike (Setyawati et al., 2024).

Halal tourism holds immense potential as a strategic economic sector, with its contribution projected to reach USD 300 billion globally by 2026. However, this sector faces several critical challenges that hinder its growth and competitiveness. One major issue is the absence of standardized global halal certification, which creates uncertainty for Muslim travellers in identifying destinations that fully adhere to Islamic principles. Additionally, the limited availability of halal-friendly facilities, such as prayer rooms, halal-certified restaurants, and Muslim-friendly accommodations, poses a significant barrier to meeting the expectations of Muslim tourists in both Muslim-majority and non-Muslim countries (Tangvitoontham & Sattayanuwat, 2022). Furthermore, there is insufficient understanding of the factors influencing Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty, particularly in how these elements contribute to the

global economic impact of halal tourism. This study seeks to address these gaps by exploring the interplay between tourist satisfaction, loyalty, and the economic benefits derived from halal tourism development.

The objectives of this study are to identify the key factors influencing Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty to halal tourism and to analyze the economic impact of halal tourism development on global economic growth. To address the stated objectives, this study is guided by the following research questions: What are the key factors that influence Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty in halal tourism destinations?

This study offers a novel perspective by connecting Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty with the global economic impact of halal tourism. Unlike previous studies that often focus on isolated aspects of halal tourism, this research integrates analyses of halal-friendly facilities, Islamic services, and tourists' overall experiences to provide a holistic understanding of the sector's potential. By employing a data-driven approach, the study aims to bridge the existing knowledge gap and provide actionable insights for policymakers and industry stakeholders to enhance the competitiveness and sustainability of halal tourism destinations.

The research offers a unique contribution by examining the holistic interplay of halal-friendly facilities, Islamic services, and overall tourist experiences. Unlike previous studies, which often focus on isolated aspects of halal tourism, this study integrates these elements to provide a comprehensive framework for understanding the sector's potential. By employing a data-driven approach, the study bridges the existing knowledge gap, delivering actionable insights for policymakers and industry stakeholders. This unique perspective not only enhances the understanding of the economic impact of halal tourism but also informs strategies to address the sector's challenges, such as certification standardization and infrastructure development. Ultimately, this research contributes to building a robust and sustainable halal tourism ecosystem that benefits both tourists and host destinations.

RESEARCH METHODS

This study follows the PRISMA 2020 guidelines to ensure a systematic and transparent approach in identifying, screening, and including relevant literature for review. The methodology was carefully designed to capture a comprehensive understanding of the topic while adhering to rigorous academic standards. The process includes four key phases: identification, screening, eligibility, and inclusion, as depicted in the PRISMA 2020 flow diagram (Fig. 1), which uses a template from Page et al. (2021),

The search process began by constructing a search string to ensure the retrieval of relevant studies. This search was conducted across seven academic databases, including IEEE, Taylor & Francis, ScienceDirect, ACM Digital Library, Scopus, Google Scholar, and Emerald, yielding a total of 7,784 documents. Specifically, the database breakdown is as follows: IEEE contributed 10 documents, Taylor & Francis 65 documents, ScienceDirect 355 documents, ACM Digital Library 4 documents, Scopus 20 documents, Google Scholar 7,330 documents, and Emerald 779

documents. These databases were selected to balance academic rigor with broader coverage, ensuring the inclusion of high-quality sources from platforms like Scopus and IEEE while also considering general sources such as Google Scholar to minimize potential quality bias.

To address missing articles, documentation services were utilized, including institutional library tools and direct correspondence with authors when necessary, ensuring access to as many relevant studies as possible. Duplicate records were first removed, reducing the total number of documents by 355. A timeline filter was then applied, restricting the search to studies published between 2019 and 2024. This timeframe was chosen because it represents the most recent and relevant research developments in the field, while studies prior to 2019 were considered less relevant due to outdated contexts or methodologies. This step excluded an additional 2,090 records, leaving 5,339 records for title and abstract screening.

During the screening phase, a detailed assessment of article relevance was conducted based on predefined inclusion criteria. Articles were evaluated for their alignment with the study's focus on halal tourism determinants, such as CHSE implementation, traveller satisfaction, or economic impacts. This resulted in the exclusion of 5,200 articles that did not meet the relevance criteria, leaving 139 articles for retrieval.

Among these, 20 articles could not be accessed due to availability issues despite efforts to use documentation services, leaving 119 articles for detailed eligibility assessment. The eligibility phase involved a rigorous examination of the remaining articles to ensure compliance with the study's inclusion and exclusion criteria. Articles that were non-final publications, non-English studies, or lacked relevance to the core focus of halal tourism were excluded.

Ultimately, 102 articles were excluded during this phase, leaving 17 articles deemed highly relevant and included in the review. These articles, all published between 2019 and 2024, provide a robust foundation for analyzing halal tourism determinants and their economic impacts. The systematic process is visually summarized in the PRISMA 2020 flow diagram (Fig. 1), which highlights the filtering stages and the rigorous criteria applied at each phase. By adhering to these methods, the study ensures reliability and validity in its selection process, providing a strong basis for the systematic literature review.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

This chapter presents the findings from the systematic literature review and provides a comprehensive discussion addressing the research objectives and questions. The results are organized to first highlight the characteristics of the included studies, followed by an in-depth analysis of the determinants influencing Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty, as well as the economic impacts of halal tourism. Each section is structured to synthesize the findings while connecting them to broader implications in the context of halal tourism development. The discussion further integrates insights from the selected articles, offering critical interpretations and practical recommendations to advance the understanding and growth of halal tourism globally.

Characteristics of Included Studies

The systematic review identified 17 studies that met the inclusion criteria, representing a diverse range of topics, methodologies, and geographical focuses. These studies, selected through the PRISMA process, provide a robust foundation for analyzing the determinants and economic impacts of halal tourism. The selected articles cover themes such as CHSE (Cleanliness, Health, Safety, and Environment) implementation, tourist satisfaction and loyalty, accessibility, faith-based marketing, and economic contributions to halal tourism. The details of these studies, including their authors, publication year, research focus, methodology, and key findings, are summarized in Table 2. This table serves to provide an overview of the characteristics of the included studies, offering insights into the scope and diversity of the reviewed literature.

Table 1. Characteristics and Key Determinants of Halal Tourism Studies

No	Author(s) and Year	Study Location	Study Objective/Fo cus	Methodology	Key Findings	Relevance to Halal Tourism	Key Determinants or Themes
1	(Peristiwo, 2020b)	Indonesia and Malaysia	To analyze the potential of Indonesia and Malaysia in the halal tourism industry.	Qualitative analysis using literature review	Highlighted opportunities and challenges in establishing halal tourism as a significant contributor to economic growth.	Explores strategies for positioning Indonesia and Malaysia as global leaders in halal tourism.	Economic growth, policy alignment
2	(Sudarsono et al., 2021a)	Indonesia	To explore the impact of religiosity and knowledge on the intention of young Muslims to engage in halal tourism.	Purposive sampling survey of young Muslims in 27 provinces	Found that religiosity and knowledge significantly influence attitudes and intentions towards halal tourism destinations.	Addresses how cultural and religious factors shape preferences for halal tourism.	Religiosity, knowledge
3	(Amalia et al., 2024a)	Indonesia	To develop a sustainable strategy for halal tourism focusing on innovation and	Quantitative study with PLS-SEM on 442 inbound tourists	Innovation and environmental concern are critical for sustainable halal tourism development,	Provides insights into sustainability- focused innovation for enhancing	Sustainability, innovation

			environmenta l concern.		enhancing satisfaction.	halal tourism experiences.	
4	(Trisnaningtias et al., 2021a)	Indonesia	To assess the influence of product and price on customer satisfaction in shariacompliant hotels.	Quantitative analysis using linear regression on survey data	Product quality and fair pricing positively impact customer satisfaction in halal-compliant hospitality services.	Highlights the role of pricing and product quality in shaping customer satisfaction within halal tourism accommodati ons.	Product quality, pricing
5	(Suhartanto et al., 2021a)	Indonesia	To investigate factors influencing loyalty in halal tourism, focusing on halal experience and perceived value.	Survey-based study with PLS-SEM on 522 Muslim tourists	Halal experience, perceived quality, and satisfaction significantly drive loyalty; human interaction had the most impact.	Focuses on the relationship between tourists' halal experiences and loyalty, critical for market retention strategies.	Halal experience, perceived value, loyalty
6	(Jia & Chaozhi, 2020a)	Islamic and Non-Islamic Destinations	To compare the trends and development strategies of halal tourism in Islamic vs. non-Islamic destinations.	data and policy	Found significant differences in the development of halal tourism; non-Islamic destinations focus on economic benefits, while Islamic destinations also emphasize cultural and	Highlights how different contexts approach halal tourism, showcasing the importance of tailored strategies for both types of destinations.	Destination strategies, cultural preservation

					religious preservation.		
7	(Boğan et al., 2023a)	Turkey	To investigate factors influencing employees' job pursuit intention in halal hotels, focusing on age and gender as moderators.	Quantitative survey method; analysis with structural equation modeling.	Age and gender significantly moderate the relationship between organizational factors (e.g., training, incentives) and job pursuit intentions, showing varied employee needs in halal contexts.	Demonstrates the need for inclusive management strategies in halal tourism to attract and retain talent.	Workforce management, inclusivity
8	(Papastathopoulo s et al., 2020a)	UAE	To uncover Muslim tourists' service preferences and their willingness to pay premium.	Finite mixture partial least squares (FMPLS) and importance-performance analysis (IPA).	Identified critical service attributes for Muslim tourists, including physical and non-physical Islamic attributes, and their influence on revisit intentions and premium spending.	Provides insights into service enhancements that can boost competitivene ss and guest loyalty in halal tourism.	Service quality, revisit intentions
9	(Azam et al., 2019a)	Malaysia	To define halal tourism and explore its role in achieving sustainable development goals (SDGs).	Literature review and secondary data analysis.	Halal tourism aligns with multiple SDGs, including sustainable consumption and cultural preservation. Emphasizes the holistic nature	Shows how halal tourism integrates with broader sustainability goals, expanding its appeal to non-Muslim markets.	Sustainability, SDG integration

					of halal tourism beyond religious contexts.		
10	(Bunakov et al., 2019)	Russia, Uzbekistan, Tajikistan	To examine organizationa l peculiarities of halal tourism in Muslim republics.	Mixed methods: bibliographic search, statistical analysis, expert evaluation, and process optimization.	Identified key challenges such as infrastructural gaps, local resistance, and religious considerations. Suggested strategies for improving the halal tourism ecosystem in Muslim republics.	Highlights region-specific barriers and opportunities, enriching the understanding of localized halal tourism strategies.	Infrastructure, local barriers, ecosystem optimization
11	(Purwandani & Yusuf, 2024b)	Indonesia	Examines localization of halal tourism policies within local customs, Qanun, and marketing strategies.	Policy analysis and case studies	Found significant potential in localizing halal tourism through integration with local customs and regulations (Qanun).		Localization, policy integration, cultural alignment
12	(Zarkasyi et al., 2021)	Indonesia	Investigates stakeholder awareness and interest in halal tourism focusing on religiosity and policy relevance.	Mixed methods: Surveys and interviews	Highlighted the importance of religiosity and stakeholder interest as drivers of halal tourism adoption and its perception.	Addresses religiosity and engagement to enhance policy acceptance and stakeholder collaboration.	Religiosity, stakeholder awareness, policy support

12	/ A d a l a t a l	Global	A moltyr===	Content	Identified	Evalores	Information
13	(Adel et al., 2021a)	(focus: non-OIC)	Analyzes halal strategies on official government tourism websites from non- Islamic countries.	analysis of government websites	Identified gaps in halal information offered by non-Islamic countries, with notable successes in countries like New Zealand and Singapore.	Explores digital marketing efforts by non-Islamic destinations to attract Muslim tourists.	availability, digital marketing, halal strategy
14	(Vargas-Sanchez et al., 2020a)	Indonesia	Explores perceptions of halal tourism among Indonesians, focusing on mental constructs and support levels.	Structured surveys	Found that perceptions of benefits, barriers, religiosity, and attractiveness significantly shape support for halal tourism development in Indonesia.	Highlights how mental constructs and community perceptions affect halal tourism policy success.	Mental constructs, community support, benefit/barrier assessment
15	(Nisha & Cheung, 2022a)	Global (focus: Asia)	Investigates the experiences and perceptions of female Muslim travelers in tourism research, highlighting gendered aspects.	Literature review and narrative synthesis	Highlighted the influence of Islamic principles and societal norms on female Muslim travelers' tourism consumption and experiences.	Sheds light on gender- specific challenges and opportunities in halal tourism for Muslim women travelers.	Gender norms, Islamic principles, travel motivations for Muslim women
16	(Yusuf et al., 2021b)	Aceh Province, Indonesia	To identify the determinants of tourists' intention	Quantitative; survey with 300 respondents; multiple	Access, communication , environment, and service are significant	Highlights the role of Islamic environment and service	Access, communicatio n, Islamic environment, service quality

			towards halal tourism in Aceh Province.	linear regression	determinants of tourists' intention, with Islamic environment and services being the most dominant factors.	quality in shaping perceptions and intention towards halal tourism.	
17 (Yulita 2024a	asari et al.,	Lampung, Indonesia	To analyze the effect of CHSE implementati on on economic growth potential in halal tourism with interest in returning as a moderating variable.	Quantitative; 132 respondents; PLS-SEM	CHSE implementation significantly impacts economic growth in halal tourism; interest in returning moderates this relationship effectively.	Demonstrates the critical role of CHSE (Cleanliness, Health, Safety, Environment) protocols in fostering economic growth and repeat visits in halal tourism.	CHSE implementatio n, interest in returning, economic growth

Based on Table 2, the analysis of 17 journals highlights the diverse approaches and findings in halal tourism research, emphasizing critical determinants such as CHSE implementation, service quality, accessibility, and Islamic environment. These studies demonstrate how these factors collectively shape tourist satisfaction, loyalty, and economic growth potential, offering valuable insights into the strategic development of sustainable halal tourism. This synthesis underscores the importance of aligning cultural, operational, and economic priorities to optimize the sector's global impact.

Determinants Influencing Muslim Tourists' Satisfaction and Loyalty

The analysis of the selected 17 studies reveals several key determinants influencing Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty, which are critical for the sustainable growth of halal tourism. These determinants include CHSE (Cleanliness, Health, Safety, and Environment) implementation, accessibility, faith-based marketing, and service quality. Each of these factors plays a significant role in shaping the overall experience of Muslim travellers and their intention to revisit halal tourism destinations. CHSE implementation has emerged as a critical determinant, particularly in the post-pandemic context, where travellers are increasingly prioritizing health and

safety standards. Yulitasari et al. (2024b) demonstrated that the successful implementation of CHSE protocols in halal tourism enhances tourists' trust and contributes significantly to economic growth. Moreover, interest in returning, as a moderating variable, was found to amplify the impact of CHSE on tourist satisfaction and loyalty. This underscores the importance of maintaining rigorous cleanliness and safety standards to attract repeat visitors. Similarly, Suhartanto et al. (2021b) highlighted that the perceived quality of CHSE-compliant facilities directly influences loyalty, making it a pivotal factor in competitive halal tourism markets (Suhartanto et al., 2021b).

Accessibility is another determinant frequently highlighted in the reviewed studies. Accessible destinations, characterized by ease of transportation, visa policies, and culturally familiar environments, significantly impact tourists' decision-making processes. Yusuf et al. (2021a) emphasized that accessibility, coupled with a strong Islamic environment, greatly influences tourists' intention to visit halal tourism destinations in Aceh Province. The study identified that the availability of halal-certified services and infrastructure is a decisive factor for Muslim travellers, particularly those prioritizing faith-compliant experiences. Faith-based marketing strategies also play a crucial role in influencing satisfaction and loyalty. Adel et al. (2021b) explored how government tourism websites in non-Muslim-majority countries strategically integrate halal-specific information to attract Muslim tourists. Their findings suggest that faith-based marketing, which highlights culturally appropriate services and Islamic values, enhances the perceived trustworthiness of destinations. Additionally, Jia and Chaozhi (2020b) noted significant differences in how Islamic and non-Islamic destinations implement these strategies, with the latter focusing on economic benefits while leveraging halal certification as a key marketing tool (Adel et al., 2021b).

Service quality was consistently identified as a determinant influencing both satisfaction and revisit intention. Papastathopoulos et al. (2020b) emphasized that physical and non-physical Islamic attributes, such as prayer facilities, halal food options, and culturally sensitive interactions, are vital in meeting Muslim tourists' expectations. These attributes, combined with a high standard of customer service, contribute to a positive travel experience, ultimately fostering loyalty. Trisnaningtias et al. (2021b) further supported this by demonstrating that product quality and fair pricing in sharia-compliant hotels significantly enhance customer satisfaction, which is a precursor to loyalty. The findings also highlight the integration of sustainability and innovation as emerging determinants in halal tourism. Amalia et al. (2024b) revealed that innovation in services and environmental concerns are critical in aligning halal tourism with global sustainability goals. The study found that Muslim travellers increasingly value destinations that promote eco-friendly practices, further enhancing their satisfaction and loyalty. This aligns with Azam et al. (2019b), who argued that halal tourism's scope extends beyond religious compliance to encompass broader sustainability principles, making it appealing to both Muslim and non-Muslim travellers (Amalia et al., 2024b).

When discussing these findings, it is essential to link them to Research Question 1: "What are the key factors that influence Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty in halal tourism destinations?" The reviewed studies collectively demonstrate that Muslim tourists prioritize destinations that align with their religious values while also offering high-quality, safe, and accessible services. These determinants, when effectively implemented, significantly boost satisfaction and loyalty, as evidenced by multiple studies (Sudarsono et al., 2021b). Comparing these findings with existing literature further validates their relevance. The role of CHSE protocols, for instance, aligns with broader tourism trends emphasizing health and safety post-pandemic. Similarly, the focus on accessibility and service quality is consistent with global research on enhancing tourist experiences, underscoring their universal applicability in the halal tourism context. However, the integration of faith-based marketing and sustainability as determinants highlights unique aspects of halal tourism that differentiate it from other tourism sectors (Peristiwo, 2020a).

A critical analysis also reveals areas for improvement. For example, while many studies highlight the importance of service quality and CHSE, fewer address the role of digital transformation in enhancing these determinants. Adel et al. (2021b) identified gaps in digital marketing strategies, particularly in non-Muslim-majority destinations, suggesting opportunities for further research and innovation. In conclusion, the determinants influencing Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty are multifaceted, encompassing health and safety standards, accessibility, faith-based marketing, and service quality. These factors not only shape the overall travel experience but also directly impact economic growth and sustainability in halal tourism. By addressing these determinants, destinations can enhance their competitiveness and appeal to a growing segment of Muslim travelers. As highlighted by the reviewed studies, a strategic focus on these elements is crucial for the long-term success of halal tourism (Adel et al., 2021b).

Economic Impacts of Halal Tourism

Halal tourism has become a powerful contributor to economic growth globally, with its impact visible in various areas, such as job creation, GDP contributions, and market potential. Across the studies reviewed, several consistent themes emerge, highlighting the significant role halal tourism plays in enhancing economic outcomes in Muslim-majority countries and beyond. Job creation is one of the most tangible economic impacts of halal tourism. As destinations expand their halal tourism offerings, there is a growing demand for skilled labor in the hospitality, service, and management sectors. For instance, Peristiwo (2020a) highlights how the halal tourism sectors in Indonesia and Malaysia have significantly boosted employment opportunities by integrating local businesses into the tourism supply chain. This integration not only supports job creation but also fosters community involvement and economic inclusivity, which are crucial for long-term growth (Peristiwo, 2020a).

The contribution to GDP is another pivotal impact. Malaysia's halal tourism industry, for example, has been identified as a key economic driver, contributing significantly to the country's

GDP through both domestic and international tourism (Azam et al., 2019b). Similarly, Indonesia's strategic focus on promoting halal tourism has led to an increase in foreign exchange earnings, which positively affects macroeconomic stability. Yulitasari et al. (2024b) further elaborate that the implementation of CHSE protocols in halal tourism has a direct impact on boosting economic activity by attracting more international tourists, thereby increasing overall spending and driving economic growth. Market potential is also a defining feature of halal tourism's economic impact. The sector continues to expand beyond traditional markets, with non-Muslim-majority countries actively targeting Muslim tourists to diversify their tourism offerings. Adel et al. (2021b) found that countries such as New Zealand and Singapore have successfully positioned themselves as halal-friendly destinations by incorporating halal certification and marketing strategies tailored to Muslim travelers. These efforts not only expand the global footprint of halal tourism but also unlock new revenue streams for these countries (Adel et al., 2021b).

A critical factor underpinning these economic contributions is tourist satisfaction and loyalty. Suhartanto et al. (2021b) demonstrate that when Muslim tourists experience high levels of satisfaction, they are more likely to revisit destinations and recommend them to others (Suhartanto et al., 2021b). This cycle of loyalty and advocacy generates sustained economic benefits, as repeat visitors tend to spend more and contribute to the local economy over time. Moreover, Vargas-Sanchez et al. (2020b) emphasize the role of community support in ensuring the success of halal tourism initiatives, which in turn drives economic benefits by fostering a positive environment for tourism development (Vargas-Sanchez et al., 2020b). Regional differences in the economic impacts of halal tourism highlight the importance of tailoring strategies to local contexts. In Muslim-majority countries like Indonesia and Malaysia, halal tourism aligns closely with national development goals, serving as a vehicle for promoting cultural heritage and economic self-reliance (Purwandani & Yusuf, 2024a). On the other hand, non-Muslim-majority destinations often focus on the financial incentives of attracting Muslim tourists, leveraging halal tourism to boost their competitiveness in the global tourism market (Jia & Chaozhi, 2020b).

Addressing Research Question 2—"How does the development of halal tourism contribute to global economic growth?"—the reviewed studies provide robust evidence of its far-reaching economic impact. The ability of halal tourism to generate employment, increase GDP contributions, and open new market opportunities underscores its potential as a transformative economic force. Furthermore, the integration of sustainability principles into halal tourism, as noted by Amalia et al. (2024b), ensures that its economic benefits are not achieved at the expense of environmental or social well-being. The findings also shed light on policy implications (Amalia et al., 2024b). Governments and industry stakeholders must adopt a holistic approach to halal tourism development, focusing not only on economic outcomes but also on enhancing service quality and sustainability. For instance, Zarkasyi et al. (2021) highlight the need for greater awareness and collaboration among stakeholders to align halal tourism initiatives with broader economic objectives. Additionally, targeted investments in infrastructure, such as halal-certified

hotels and CHSE-compliant facilities, can further amplify the sector's economic contributions (ZARKASYI et al., 2021).

In conclusion, halal tourism plays a vital role in driving economic growth by creating jobs, contributing to GDP, and tapping into new market opportunities. By fostering tourist satisfaction and loyalty, destinations can unlock sustained economic benefits while simultaneously advancing their development goals. The integration of cultural, economic, and sustainability considerations ensures that halal tourism remains a dynamic and impactful sector in the global economy.

Synthesis and Insights

This section integrates the findings of the systematic review with the research objectives, offering a comprehensive synthesis of key determinants influencing Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty, as well as the global economic impacts of halal tourism. It further provides a critical comparison with broader literature, practical implications for stakeholders, and directions for future research to advance the understanding and development of halal tourism.

Addressing the Research Objectives

The findings from the systematic review align closely with the research objectives, providing valuable insights into the key determinants influencing Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty, as well as the global economic impacts of halal tourism. Firstly, in identifying the key determinants of Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty, several studies emphasize the importance of aligning tourism services with Islamic principles and the unique needs of Muslim travellers. Papastathopoulos et al. (2020b) highlight that Muslim tourists prioritize services that cater to their religious requirements, such as halal food availability, prayer facilities, and modest dress codes among staff (Papastathopoulos et al., 2020b). These services significantly enhance their satisfaction and intention to revisit. Similarly, Suhartanto et al. (2021b) found that the tourist experience in halal tourism, encompassing service quality, destination image, and emotional experience, leads to increased loyalty among Muslim tourists (Suhartanto et al., 2021b).

The implementation of CHSE (Cleanliness, Health, Safety, and Environment) protocols has emerged as a critical determinant, especially in the wake of the COVID-19 pandemic. Yulitasari et al. (2024b) demonstrated that CHSE implementation positively influences tourists' interest in returning, which in turn enhances the potential for economic growth in halal tourism destinations (Yulitasari et al., 2024b). This finding underscores the importance of health and safety measures in boosting tourist satisfaction and loyalty. Accessibility is another significant factor influencing satisfaction and loyalty. Yusuf et al. (2021a) identified that access, communication, environment, and service are determinants of tourists' intention to visit halal tourism destinations in Aceh Province, with the Islamic environment and services being the most dominant factors (Yusuf et al., 2021a). The ease of accessing halal services and facilities contributes to a more satisfying travel experience for Muslim tourists.

Faith-based marketing strategies play a crucial role in attracting Muslim tourists and enhancing their satisfaction. Adel et al. (2021b) analyzed halal strategies on official government tourism websites and found that providing comprehensive halal-related information significantly impacts Muslim tourists' destination choices (Adel et al., 2021b). By aligning marketing efforts with the religious and cultural values of Muslim tourists, destinations can improve satisfaction and encourage repeat visits. The role of innovation and environmental concern is also highlighted as a determinant in the halal tourism industry. Amalia et al. (2024b) emphasized that innovation in services and a focus on environmental sustainability contribute to the sustainable development of the halal tourism industry, meeting the growing environmental concerns of tourists and enhancing their overall satisfaction (Amalia et al., 2024b).

Secondly, in analyzing the global economic impacts of halal tourism, the reviewed studies reveal significant contributions to economic growth, job creation, and market potential. Azam et al. (2019b) discuss that halal tourism not only caters to the religious needs of Muslim tourists but also promotes sustainable development by encouraging responsible tourism practices that benefit local economies (Azam et al., 2019b). The expansion of halal tourism markets opens new opportunities for economic diversification, especially in Muslim-majority countries. Peristiwo (2020a) examined the potential for halal tourism industries in Indonesia and Malaysia, highlighting how the development of halal tourism contributes to GDP growth and creates employment opportunities (Peristiwo, 2020a). The study emphasizes that by tapping into the growing Muslim travel market, these countries can enhance their economic development and global competitiveness.

In addition, the localization of halal tourism policies within local customs and regulations, as explored by Purwandani and Yusuf (2024a) demonstrates how integrating halal tourism into existing cultural frameworks can enhance its economic viability and appeal to both domestic and international tourists (Purwandani & Yusuf, 2024a). This approach not only preserves cultural identity but also stimulates economic activity. The economic impact extends to non-Muslimmajority destinations as well. Jia and Chaozhi (2020b) investigated whether halal tourism trends are similar in non-Islamic destinations compared to Islamic ones, finding that non-Islamic destinations are increasingly adopting halal-friendly services to attract Muslim tourists, thereby contributing to their economic growth (Jia & Chaozhi, 2020b).

Furthermore, the expansion of halal tourism has implications for the labour market. Boğan et al. (2023b) explored factors related to halal tourism that influence employees' job pursuit intentions in halal hotels, indicating that the growth of this sector creates new employment opportunities and requires a workforce that is knowledgeable about Islamic principles (Boğan et al., 2023b). In conclusion, the findings align with the research objectives by identifying key determinants such as adherence to Islamic principles, CHSE implementation, accessibility, faith-based marketing, innovation, and environmental concerns that influence Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty. Additionally, the development of halal tourism contributes significantly to

global economic growth through GDP enhancement, job creation, and market expansion. These insights underscore the importance of strategic planning and implementation in halal tourism to maximize both tourist satisfaction and economic benefits.

Comparison with Broader Literature

This section critically examines how the findings of the systematic review align with or diverge from broader literature while identifying trends, gaps, and emerging opportunities in halal tourism research. Comparing with existing studies ensures a comprehensive understanding of the sector's determinants and economic impacts.

The findings largely align with established literature emphasizing the significance of service quality, accessibility, and CHSE (Cleanliness, Health, Safety, and Environment) protocols in influencing Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty. For instance, broader studies, such as those by Amalia et al. (2024b), confirm the growing relevance of eco-tourism and innovation in meeting the expectations of environmentally conscious Muslim travellers (Amalia et al., 2024b). Similarly, Jia and Chaozhi (2020b) validate the importance of halal certification and cultural sensitivity in both Islamic and non-Islamic destinations (Jia & Chaozhi, 2020b). However, divergences are noted, particularly in regional contexts. While the reviewed studies predominantly focus on Southeast Asia, broader literature highlights significant developments in non-Muslim-majority countries like Japan and New Zealand, where halal tourism is used to diversify markets (Adel et al., 2021b). Additionally, certain gaps persist, such as limited exploration of digital transformation's role in enhancing the halal tourist experience and addressing the unique needs of niche segments like female Muslim travellers (Nisha & Cheung, 2022b).

Emerging opportunities in halal tourism research include integrating digital tools for destination marketing, advancing sustainability practices, and tailoring services for diverse demographics. The growth of halal tourism in non-Muslim-majority destinations also presents a promising avenue for future exploration. In conclusion, while the findings align with core themes in the broader literature, addressing identified gaps, such as digitalization and niche traveller insights, can propel halal tourism research and practice to new heights, fostering a more inclusive and innovative industry.

Practical Implications

The findings from this study provide actionable insights for key stakeholders in the halal tourism sector, including policymakers, destination managers, and service providers, to enhance service quality, improve tourist satisfaction, and strengthen the economic viability of halal tourism. For policymakers, the research emphasizes the importance of establishing comprehensive halal tourism frameworks. These should include robust CHSE (Cleanliness, Health, Safety, and Environment) standards and clear halal certification processes to build trust and confidence among Muslim tourists. Policies promoting eco-tourism and sustainability, as highlighted by Amalia et al. (2024b), can further align with global travel trends while supporting environmental and cultural

preservation. Additionally, fostering collaborations between government bodies and private stakeholders can enhance destination appeal and competitiveness in both Muslim-majority and non-Muslim-majority countries.

Destination managers should focus on integrating faith-based services into their offerings, such as halal-certified food, prayer facilities, and culturally sensitive staff training. Investing in accessibility and digital marketing strategies, as recommended by Adel et al. (2021b), can improve destination visibility and attract a wider audience. Furthermore, localizing tourism policies to incorporate regional customs and traditions, as noted by Purwandani and Yusuf (2024a), can enhance the authenticity and attractiveness of halal tourism experiences. For service providers, maintaining high service quality remains essential for fostering tourist satisfaction and loyalty. Tailored training programs for staff to understand and respect Islamic values, coupled with innovative solutions such as mobile apps for halal service navigation, can significantly enhance the Muslim travel experience. Suhartanto et al. (2021b) highlight that personalized and culturally sensitive services play a pivotal role in ensuring repeat visits and positive word-of-mouth. In conclusion, these strategic recommendations underscore the importance of collaboration and innovation among stakeholders to optimize service quality, enhance satisfaction, and ensure the sustainable growth of halal tourism in a competitive global market.

Limitations and Future Research Directions

While this study provides valuable insights into halal tourism, several limitations must be acknowledged. First, the scope of the systematic review is confined to journal articles published between 2019 and 2024, which, although recent, may exclude earlier foundational studies that could offer additional context. Second, the geographical focus of the selected studies leans heavily towards. Southeast Asia, particularly Indonesia and Malaysia, potentially limiting the generalizability of findings to other regions where halal tourism is growing, such as Europe and the Middle East. This regional bias underscores the need for a more global perspective in future research. Additionally, there is a possibility of publication bias, as studies with positive results or those published in high-impact journals may have been overrepresented, leaving valuable grey literature unexplored.

Future research should address these limitations by expanding the scope of analysis to include a more diverse geographical representation and incorporating various types of publications, such as government reports and case studies. Emerging areas also present exciting opportunities for further exploration. For instance, the role of digital technologies in enhancing halal tourism experiences, such as the use of AI-driven personalization, mobile applications for halal service navigation, and blockchain for halal certification, remains underexplored. Such technologies can play a crucial role in meeting the evolving needs of Muslim travellers. Moreover, examining niche market segments, such as female Muslim travellers or the preferences of Gen Z tourists, could provide deeper insights into underserved demographics. Research into the economic and cultural implications of integrating sustainability practices into halal tourism, as highlighted

by Amalia et al. (2024b), can further advance the field. By addressing these gaps, future studies can contribute to a more comprehensive understanding of halal tourism and its potential to evolve into a globally inclusive and sustainable industry

CONCLUSION

This study provides a comprehensive analysis of the key determinants influencing Muslim tourists' satisfaction and loyalty, as well as the economic impacts of halal tourism. The findings effectively address the research questions, demonstrating that factors such as CHSE implementation, accessibility, service quality, and faith-based marketing play critical roles in shaping the halal tourism experience. By fostering high levels of satisfaction and loyalty, these determinants contribute significantly to repeat visits and positive word-of-mouth, which are vital for sustaining growth in this sector. Additionally, the economic contributions of halal tourism, including job creation, GDP enhancement, and market diversification, underscore its role as a transformative force in the global tourism industry.

The research highlights not only the alignment with existing literature but also identifies emerging opportunities, such as the integration of digital technologies and sustainability practices. While the study addresses the core research questions, it also acknowledges limitations related to geographical focus and publication bias. Future research should expand its scope to include a broader range of regions and explore niche market segments, such as female Muslim travelers or Gen Z preferences. By leveraging these insights, stakeholders can optimize the potential of halal tourism, ensuring its growth as an inclusive, sustainable, and economically impactful industry.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Adel, A. M., Dai, X., Yan, C., & Roshdy, R. S. (2021a). Halal strategies on official government tourism websites: An extension and validation study. *Tourism and Hospitality Research*, 21(2), 229–244. https://doi.org/10.1177/1467358420986236
- Adel, A. M., Dai, X., Yan, C., & Roshdy, R. S. (2021b). Halal strategies on official government tourism websites: An extension and validation study. *Tourism and Hospitality Research*, 21(2), 229–244. https://doi.org/10.1177/1467358420986236
- Adie, B. A. (2019). Marketing Europe to Islamic Heritage Tourists. In *The Routledge Handbook of Halal Hospitality and Islamic Tourism* (pp. 157–168). Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315150604-11
- Amalia, F. A., Nova, M., Koh, C., & Suhartanto, D. (2024a). Sustainable development in halal tourism industry: The role of innovation and environmental concern. *E3S Web of Conferences*, 479. https://doi.org/10.1051/e3sconf/202447907038

- Amalia, F. A., Nova, M., Koh, C., & Suhartanto, D. (2024b). Sustainable development in halal tourism industry: The role of innovation and environmental concern. *E3S Web of Conferences*, 479, 07038. https://doi.org/10.1051/e3sconf/202447907038
- Azam, M. S. E., Abdullah, M. A., & Razak, D. A. (2019a). Halal tourism: definition, justification, and scopes towards sustainable development. *International Journal of Business, Economics and Law*, 18(3), 23–31.
- Azam, M. S. E., Abdullah, M. A., & Razak, D. A. (2019b). Halal tourism: definition, justification, and scopes towards sustainable development. *International Journal of Business, Economics and Law*, 18(3), 23–31.
- Boğan, E., Saraç, Ö., Kiper, V. O., & Batman, O. (2023a). Exploring halal tourism-related factors that mitigate employees' job pursuit intention in halal hotels: The moderating roles of age and gender. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, 55(September 2022), 368–379. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhtm.2023.05.012
- Boğan, E., Saraç, Ö., Kiper, V. O., & Batman, O. (2023b). Exploring halal tourism-related factors that mitigate employees' job pursuit intention in halal hotels: The moderating roles of age and gender. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, 55, 368–379. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhtm.2023.05.012
- Bunakov, O. A., Aslanova, D. K., Zaitseva, N. A., Larionova, A. A., Chudnovskiy, A. D., & Eidelman, B. M. (2019). Religious and halal tourism organization peculiarities in muslim republics. *European Journal of Science and Theology*, 15(3), 85–96.
- Jia, X., & Chaozhi, Z. (2020a). "Halal tourism": is it the same trend in non-Islamic destinations with Islamic destinations? *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research*, 25(2), 189–204. https://doi.org/10.1080/10941665.2019.1687535
- Jia, X., & Chaozhi, Z. (2020b). "Halal tourism": is it the same trend in non-Islamic destinations with Islamic destinations? *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research*, 25(2), 189–204. https://doi.org/10.1080/10941665.2019.1687535
- Mohajer, B., Kuhzady, S., Bazrafshan, M., & Sedaghat, M. (2022). Muslim tourism. In *Contemporary Muslim Travel Cultures* (pp. 47–60). Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003036296-4
- Nisha, F., & Cheung, C. (2022a). Locating Muslimah in the travel and tourism research. *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 41(February), 100940. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2022.100940
- Nisha, F., & Cheung, C. (2022b). Locating Muslimah in the travel and tourism research. *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 41, 100940. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2022.100940

- Papastathopoulos, A., Kaminakis, K., & Mertzanis, C. (2020a). What services do Muslim tourists want? Uncovering nonlinear relationships and unobserved heterogeneity. *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 35(January), 100720. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2020.100720
- Papastathopoulos, A., Kaminakis, K., & Mertzanis, C. (2020b). What services do Muslim tourists want? Uncovering nonlinear relationships and unobserved heterogeneity. *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 35, 100720. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2020.100720
- Peristiwo, H. (2020a). Indonesian and Malaysian potential for a halal tourism industry. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, 9(1), 1–16.
- Peristiwo, H. (2020b). Indonesian and Malaysian potential for a halal tourism industry. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, 9(1), 1 16.
- Purwandani, I., & Yusuf, M. (2024a). Localizing Indonesian Halal tourism policy within local customs, *Qanun*, and marketing. *Journal of Policy Research in Tourism, Leisure and Events*, 16(2), 246–264. https://doi.org/10.1080/19407963.2021.1996382
- Purwandani, I., & Yusuf, M. (2024b). Localizing Indonesian Halal tourism policy within local customs, Qanun, and marketing. *Journal of Policy Research in Tourism, Leisure and Events*, 16(2), 246–264. https://doi.org/10.1080/19407963.2021.1996382
- Setiawan, F., Qadariyah, L., Nahidloh, S., Dzikrulloh, Holis, & Jumanto, J. (2024). Towards SDG Sustainable Halal Tourism Development: Integration of Sustainability and Religious Morality. *Journal of Lifestyle and SDGs Review*, *5*(2), e02893. https://doi.org/10.47172/2965-730X.SDGsReview.v5.n02.pe02893
- Setyawati, H. A., Wibawanto, S., Fauzi, A. I., & Rukmana, F. A. (2024). Muslim-friendly Tourism and Tourism Attractiveness Improving Revisit Intention Muslim Gen-Z. *Grenze International Journal of Engineering & Technology (GIJET)*, 10.
- Sudarsono, H., Shidiqie, J. S. A., & Tumewang, Y. K. (2021a). The impact of religiosity and knowledge on the intention of young Muslim generation toward Halal tourism in Indonesia. *Tourism and Hospitality Management*, 27(2), 255–272. https://doi.org/10.20867/thm.27.2.2
- Sudarsono, H., Shidiqie, J. S. A., & Tumewang, Y. K. (2021b). THE IMPACT OF RELIGIOSITY AND KNOWLEDGE ON THE INTENTION OF YOUNG MUSLIM GENERATION TOWARD HALAL TOURISM IN INDONESIA. *Tourism and Hospitality Management*, 27, 255–272. https://doi.org/10.20867/thm.27.2.2
- Suhartanto, D., Dean, D., Wibisono, N., Astor, Y., Muflih, M., Kartikasari, A., Sutrisno, R., & Hardiyanto, N. (2021a). Tourist experience in Halal tourism: what leads to loyalty? *Current Issues in Tourism*, 24(14), 1976–1990. https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2020.1813092

- Suhartanto, D., Dean, D., Wibisono, N., Astor, Y., Muflih, M., Kartikasari, A., Sutrisno, R., & Hardiyanto, N. (2021b). Tourist experience in Halal tourism: what leads to loyalty? *Current Issues in Tourism*, 24(14), 1976–1990. https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2020.1813092
- Tangvitoontham, N., & Sattayanuwat, W. (2022). Factors influencing Muslim tourists' decision making on choosing a destination: Case study of Muslim tourists from Organization of Islamic Cooperation. *Revista Turismo & Desenvolvimento (RT&D)/Journal of Tourism & Development*, 39.
- Trisnaningtias, D. M., Elquthb, J. N., Qurtubi, & Rachmadewi, I. P. (2021a). The Influence of Product and Price to Customer Satisfaction: Case Study at Sharia Compliant Hotel. *2021 International Conference on Sustainable Islamic Business and Finance, SIBF 2021*, 39–43. https://doi.org/10.1109/IEEECONF53626.2021.9686321
- Trisnaningtias, D. M., Elquthb, J. N., Qurtubi, & Rachmadewi, I. P. (2021b). The Influence of Product and Price to Customer Satisfaction: Case Study at Sharia Compliant Hotel. *2021 International Conference on Sustainable Islamic Business and Finance*, 39–43. https://doi.org/10.1109/IEEECONF53626.2021.9686321
- Vargas-Sanchez, A., Hariani, D., & Wijayanti, A. (2020a). Perceptions of halal tourism in Indonesia: Mental constructs and level of support. *International Journal of Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage*, 8(4), 37–49.
- Vargas-Sanchez, A., Hariani, D., & Wijayanti, A. (2020b). Perceptions of halal tourism in Indonesia: Mental constructs and level of support. *International Journal of Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage*, 8(4), 5.
- Yulitasari, L., Suryanto, T., & Hilal, S. (2024a). Influence of CHSE Implementation on Economic Growth Potential Halal Tourism with Interest in Returning as Moderating Variable. *International Journal of Economics Development Research*, 5(1), 2024–2194.
- Yulitasari, L., Suryanto, T., & Hilal, S. (2024b). The Influence of CHSE Implementation on the Economic Growth Potential Of Halal Tourism with Interest in Returning as a Moderating Variable. *International Journal of Economics Development Research (IJEDR)*, 5(1), 194–207.
- Yuliviona, R., Alias, Z., & Abdullah, M. (2019). The role of Muslim tourist satisfaction as a mediating factor in the relationship between Islamic attributes of destination and service quality on destination loyalty. *Journal of Environmental Treatment Techniques*, 7(4), 808–813.
- Yusuf, M. Y., Innayatillah, I., Isnaliana, I., & Maulana, H. (2021a). The Determinants of Tourists' Intention to Visit Halal Tourism Destinations in Aceh Province. *Samarah: Jurnal Hukum Keluarga Dan Hukum Islam*, 5(2), 892. https://doi.org/10.22373/sjhk.v5i2.9270

- Yusuf, M. Y., Innayatillah, Isnaliana, & Maulana, H. (2021b). The Determinants of Tourists' Intention to Visit Halal Tourism Destinations in Aceh Province. *Samarah*, *5*(2), 892–912. https://doi.org/10.22373/sjhk.v5i2.9270
- Zarkasyi, M. R., Kurniawan, D. A., & Darma, D. C. (2021). Urgensity of "halal tourism": Religiosity, awareness, and interest from stakeholders. *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism*, 12(4), 968–976. https://doi.org/10.14505//jemt.v12.4(52).11
- ZARKASYI, M. R., KURNIAWAN, D. A., & DARMA, D. C. (2021). Urgensity of "Halal Tourism": Religiosity, Awareness, and Interest from Stakeholders. *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism*, 12(4), 968. https://doi.org/10.14505//jemt.v12.4(52).11

Copyright holders:

Gebie Yoga Efrizal Rizkitama, Nurwahidin, Mulawarman Hannase, Mohammad Izdiyan Muttaqin, Veithzal Rivai Zainal (2024)

First publication right:

AJEMB - American Journal of Economic and Management Business